

# **KINGS LAW REPORTS (ALL SC)**

**(1996) 4 KLR PART 40 PP. 543-828  
APRIL 1996**

**Dedicated to the King of Kings**

**O.O. NOEL ESQ. Chief Editor**

## **INDEX OF CASES REPORTED**

1. Dieli v. Iwuno p. 543
2. Madumere v. Okafor p. 557
3. Edosomwan v. Ogbeyfun p. 580
4. Yesufu v. Kupper Int. N.v p. 599
5. Olugbode v. Sangodeyi p. 618
6. Gira v. State p. 638
7. Bangboye v. Olusoga p. 655
8. State v. Commissioner p. 690
9. Josia Cornelius Ltd v. Ezenwa p.703
10. Onyemeh v. Egbuchulam p. 732
11. Akunyili v. Ejidike p. 747
12. Abogede v. The State p. 783
13. Sadikwu v. Dalori p. 796
14. Okonkwo v. Ogbogu p. 810

AGENCY-Companies- Undertaking given by Chairman/director of a company- Where partnership relationship was in existence - Whether the undertaking also binds the director personally. *Yesufu v. Kupper Int. N. V.* p. 599

APPEALS- Existence of appeal- Whether from the records - Respondent's appeal that was not brought to the trial court's notice - Was actually filed and in existence. *Josiah Cornelius Ltd V. Ezenwa* p. 703

APPEALS \_ Abuse of Court's process - Whether advancing the same arguments in Supreme Court - As was in the lower court - Would make an appeal an abuse of Court's process. *Dieli v. Iwuno* p. 543.

APPEALS - Issues - That are not predicated on the grounds of appeal - Whether the grounds should be deemed abandoned -unto dismissing the appeal. *Josiah Cornelius Ltd V. Ezenwa* p. 703

APPEALS \_ Issue - Consideration of an issue - Where no useful purposes will be served - A merely academic issue will not be considered. *Yesufu V. Kupper Int. N.V.* p. 599

APPEALS \_ Evaluation of evidence - Where the trial court failed to properly evaluate the evidence - Whether appellate court should intervene. *yesufu V. Kupper Int. N. V.* p. 599

APPEALS - Leave to appeal - Where no leave was obtained to appeal against a ruling - That ruling cannot be attacked through the 1st appeal. *Josiah Cornelius Ltd V. Ezenwa* p. 703

APPEALS \_ Concurrent findings of facts - Appellate court will not interfere therewith - Save where the circumstances justify interference. *Olugbode V. Sangodeyi* p. 618

APPEALS \_ Existence of a decision - Where the decision appealed against has been rectified - That decision cannot be appealed against. *Josiah Cornelius Ltd v. Ezenwa* p. 703

APPEALS - Grounds of fact or mixed law fact - Cannot be argued - Without leave of Court. *Akunyili v. Ejldike* p. 747

APPEALS - Issue - Failure of lower court to consider an issue before it - Whether miscarriage of justice was 'occasioned, Okonkwo v. Ogbogu p. 810

APPEALS- Issue - Not raised in the lower court - Circumstances under which it may be considered. Okonkwo v. Ogbogu p. 810

APPEALS - Hearing of appeal - Writing of judgment based solely on briefs filed by parties - Amounts to no hearing - As it is contrary to the Rules. Onyemeh V. Egbuchulam p. 732

APPEALS - Decision - On an appeal without hearing the parties - Is a fundamental defect fatal to adjudication. Onyemeh V. Egbuchulam p. 732

APPEALS - Issue -Preliminary objection that issues do not emanate from the grounds - Whether well founded. Josiah Cornelius Ltd v. Ezenwa p. 703

APPEALS - Preliminary .objection - Factors that will determine propriety lit the objection - When not to be considered. Onyemeh V. Egbuchulam P. 732.

APPEALS - Preliminary objection - Where Counsel's contention is a clear misconception of issues raised - Preliminary objection lacks substance. Edosomwan V. Ogbeyfun p. 580

APPEALS - Finding of trial court - Where not challenged by Cross appeal or respondent's notice - Whether that finding must stand. Bangboye v. Olusoga p.655.

APPEALS - Concurrent findings of fact - Supreme Court will not interfere –To disturb concurrent findings of facts - Where there are no grounds for so doing. Madumere v. Okafor p. 557

APPEALS - Preliminary objection - Lacks substance - As grounds of appeal does not offend the provisions of Supreme Court Rules. Edosomwan v. Ogbeyfun p. 580

APPEALS - Right of Appeal- Exercise of constitutional right of appeal- Is not an abuse, of Court's process. Dieli v. Iwuno p. 543

**vi      INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (1996) 4 KLR**

APPEALS - Concurrent findings of fact - Appeal against concurrent findings of act - Is not an abuse of Court's process. *Dieli v. Iwuno* p. 543

APPEALS - Arguments in a brief - Must be based on issues arising and related to ground of appeal - Where not so - It is incompetent. *Madumere v. Okafor* p. 557

APPEALS - Issues for Determination - Should arise and relate to a ground of appeal. *Madumere v. Okafor* p. 557

C CLAIMS - Basis of claim - Plaintiffs claim succeeded on the partnership agreement - And not merely on the undertaking given by the 1st appellant. *Yesufu v. Kupper Int. N.V.* p. 599

D CONFLICT OF LAWS - Land Use Act 1978 s. 39 - And Land Tenure Law s. 41(1) - That give original jurisdiction to High Court - In land matters touching on statutory right of occupancy - Whether there is any conflict. *Sadikwu v. Dalori* p. 796

E COURTS - Decision - Duty of court - Court of Appeal has a duty to make known its decision on preliminary objection - Before deciding the appeal. *Onyemeh v. Egbuchulam* p. 732

CRIMINAL LAW - Murder - What the prosecution must prove beyond reasonable doubt. *Abogede v. The State* p. 783

F CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - No case submission - What court should consider at that stage - Whether a prima facie case is established. *Abogede v. The State* p. 783

G CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Murder - Whether proved beyond reasonable doubt III the circumstances of this case. *Gira v. State* p. 638

H CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Confessional statement - Is one made by appellant suggesting directly or by implication - That he committed the crime. *Gira v. State* p. 638.

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Retracting from confessional statement - Whether such retraction - Would render the confession inadmissible - Where the confession is voluntary and positive. *Gira v. State* P. 638

DAMAGES- Trespass to the person- No matter how slight- Gives right of action to recover damages. Okonkwo v. Ogbogu p. 810

DAMAGES- Quantum – Principles that guide an appellate Court-In the determination of quantum of damages. Okonkwo v. Ogbogu p. 810. **B**

ESTOPEL-Sameness of issues-Land dispute-Whether the issues in the past suit-Are the same in the present suit before the Commissioner p. 690.

ESTOPEL-Res-judicata-Need to prove all the ingredients-Whether subject matter is the same in this case. State v. commissioner. 690 **C**

EVIDENCE-Witnesses - Slip in evidence - Whether there is a slip in PW's testimony- As to who killed the deceased. Gira v. State p. 638 **D**

EVIDENCE -Burden of proof - Whether plaintiffs proved their case - On the totality of evidence adduced and accepted at the trial. Dieli v. Iwuno p. 543

EVIDENCE-Credibility of a witness - Whether every discrepancy in what evidence says - Is sufficient to destroy his credibility. Gira v. State p. 638 **E**

EVIDENCE- Credibility of a witness s. 119 E.A. - Essential requirements of section- When a party intends to impeach the credibility of a witness-With regard to statement in previous proceedings. Madumere v. Okafor p. 557 **F**

EVIDENCE- Witnesses - Inconsistency - In previous statement of a witness-can be put to the witness - For the purpose of testing his credibility. Madumere v.Okafor p. 557

EVIDENCE-Onus of proof - Facts pleaded in the statement of claim where no evidence is led in proof of them - No onus is cast on the other party - To disprove facts not established. Edosomwan v. Ogbeyfun p. 580 **G**

EVIDENCE- Affidavit - Averments in affidavit - Where not denied by counter affidavit - The facts may be regarded as duly established. State v. Commissioner p. 690 **H**

EVIDENCE - Admissibility - Statements made out of Court - By a party to the proceeding - Is admissible against that party. *Madumere v. Okafor* p. 557

EVIDENCE - Statement in previous proceedings - Whether the requirements of s. 119 E.A. - For admission of statement of a witness in previous proceedings - Where complied with. *Madumere v. Okafor* p. 557

EVIDENCE - Admission - By a party of a fact contained in a statement that was not tendered - Is evidence against that party - Whether it corroborated a written document or not. *Okonkwo v. Ogbogu* p. 810

EVIDENCE - Admissibility - Document properly rejected - Whether any evidence could be led to prove same - Where the document was not pleaded. *Madumere v. Okafor* p. 557

**D**

EVIDENCE - Cross examination - Contents of rejected document - Whether statement of plaintiffs witness under cross examination - Can be construed as giving evidence of contents of the rejected document. *Edosomwan v. Ogbeyfun* p. 580

**E**

EVIDENCE - Admissibility - Statement made by a party in civil proceedings - Adverse to his case - Is admissible against him *Edosomwan v. Ogbeyfun* p. 580

F EVIDENCE - Admissibility of document - Copy of document sought to be tendered - Whether properly rejected - Where no foundation was laid for its admission. *Edosomwan v. Ogbeyfun* p. 580.

G EVIDENCE - Admission by conduct - Clear and direct accusation of murder made against accused - Where not denied by accused - Whether evidence of admission by conduct. *Gira v. State* p. 638

EVIDENCE - Hearsay - Exhibit that was properly admitted - Whether appellants can complain it was hearsay. *Madumere v. Okafor* p. 557

**H**

EVIDENCE - Hostile witness - Defence witness that gave evidence favourable to the plaintiff - And was not treated as a hostile witness - Whether that evidence supports plaintiff's case. *Akunyili v. Ejidike* p. 747

**INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (1996) 4 KLR** ix

EVIDENCE - Credibility of a witness - Discrepancy between what a witness says at different times - Whether sufficient to destroy his credibility in every case - Duty of the judge in respect of such discrepancy. *Abogede v. The State* p. 783

EVIDENCE - Contradiction - Where prosecution witnesses gave evidence to the limit of what they observed individually - Whether they contradicted each other. *Abogede v. The State* p. 783 B

EVIDENCE - Proof - Simply pleading laches, acquiescence and standing by With no evidence thereto before the court - Is no proof of them. *Olugbode v. Sangodeyi* p. 618 C

FAIR HEARING - Denial - Whether failure to stay proceedings - Pending determination of interlocutory appeal - Amounts to denial of fair hearing *Iab Cornelius Ltd v. Ezenwa* p. 703

FAIR HEARING - Denial - Whether failure to stay proceedings - Pending determination of interlocutory appeal - Amounts to denial of fair hearing. *Josiah Cornelius Ltd v. Ezenwa* p. 703 D

JUDGMENTS - Alternative claim - Where judgment was given for the main claim - Judgment need not be given for the alternative claim. *Yesufu Kupper Int N. V.* p. 599 E

JUDGMENTS - Appeals - Nullity - Judgment of Court of Appeal - On an appeal that was never heard - Is a nullity - Hearing being a fundamental requirement for a valid adjudication. *Onyemeh V. Egbuchulam* p. 732 F

JUDGMENTS - Verdict - Of trial Court as affirmed - Is sustainable - Even without the evidence complained of. *Edosomwan v. Ogbeyfun* p. 580

JURISDICTION-Boundary determination - Whether the High Court has jurisdiction- To determine the boundary between two communities - Under the Boundaries Settlement Law. *State v. Commissioner* p. 690 G

LAND LAW- Title-Proof-Where there is conflicting traditional evidence- Whether the lower court was right-In shutting out the evidence on the other of proving title. *Akunyili v. Ejidike* p. 747 H

LAND LAW – Urban area-Power of the governor under the Act to so designate an area-Where not exercised in respect of an area – Disputed land therein remains within the control of a local government. *Sadikwu v. Dalori* p. 796

LAND -LAW - Title - Possession - Where plaintiff failed to prove title - Whether he established possession. *Bangboye v. Olusoga* p. 655

LAND LAW - Identity of the land in dispute - Where not in controversy -  
B Whether the respondents went beyond the land granted to them - By the appellant. *Akunyili v. Ejidike* p. 747

LAND LAW - Trespass - Person in exclusive possession - Can bring action for trespass against anybody - Save a person with a better title. *Akunyili v. Bjidike* p. 747

LAND LAW - Jurisdiction - In proceedings involving customary right of occupancy - Granted by a local authority - Is conferred on area or customary court - And not the High Court. *Sadikwu v. Dalori* p. 796  
D

LAND LAW - Jurisdiction - In matters relating to statutory right of occupancy \_ Exclusive original jurisdiction belong to the High Court. *Sadikwu v. Dalori* p. 796

E LAND LAW - Title - Where claimed through a grant or inheritance - Need for clear evidence of traditional history. *Bangboye v. Olusoga* p. 655

LAND LAW - Title - Traditional evidence - Where inconclusive - Whether evidence of acts of ownership and possession - Are sufficient to entitle a  
F party to declaration of title. *Akunyili v. Ejidike* p. 747

LAND LAW - Damages for trespass - Where plaintiffs claim for title failed \_  
But he was found to be in possession - Whether damages for trespass and injunction - Will be granted in plaintiffs favour. *Bangboye v. Olusoga* p. 655  
G

LAND LAW - Title - Burden of proof rest squarely on plaintiff - The weakness of respondent's case - Is no substitute to the onus on the plaintiff. *Edosomwan v. Ogbeyfun* p. 580

H LAND LAW - Non urban land - Land Use Act - Whether showing that land is an extensive farm land - Justifies inference that the land is in non urban area - Under the land Use Act. *Dieli v. Iwuno* p. 543

LAND LAW - Title - Where a party relies on documentary title - Due execution



must be proved. *Bangboye v. Olusoga* p. 665

LAND LAW -Boundary between two communities - Dismissal of plaintiff's claim per Se-Does not confer title on the defendant. *State v. Commissioner* p.690

**B**

LANDLORD & TENANT - Customary tenant - Failure to pay tribute – under Yoruba custom - Whether dependent on landlord's demand. *Olugbode v. Sangodeyi* p, 618

LANDLORD & TENANT - Forfeiture - Possession - Principle guiding reliefs C to be sought - By tenant who wants to retain possession - Against a victorious landlord on title. *Olugbode v. Sangodeyi* p. 618

LANDLORD & TENANT - Forfeiture - Gross misconduct touching directly on the Landlord's title - Whether a compelling ground for grant of forfeiture. *D Olugbode v. Sangodeyi* p. 618

LANDLORD & TENANT - Forfeiture - Relief against forfeiture claim –should not be granted to a tenant - Who did not plead for the relief. *Olugbode v. Sangodeyi* p.618

**E**

LANDLORD & TENANT- Forfeiture - Possession is automatically forfeited by a tenant - Who commits aggravated misconduct - By challenging his landlord's title. *Olugbode v. Sangodeyi* p. 618

**F**

APPEALS-Concurrent findings of courts - Whether to be interfered with – Where there is no sufficient reason to warrant such interference. *Gira v. State* p. 638

LANDLORD & TENANT -Challenge to Landlord's authority - By the tenants- G Makes the tenants trespassers. *Akunyili v. Ejidike* p. 747

LOCUS IN QUO - Visit to Locus in quo - Whether a judge can truly be said to have resided to locus - Where there is no application to that effect. *Dieli v. Iwunop* p. 543

**H**

MURDER-Burden of proof - What prosecution must prove - To discharge the burden of proof in murder charge. *Gira v. State* p. 638 .

**xii     INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (1996) 4 KLR**

MURDER - Ingredients - Of the offence of murder - Whether established prima facie. Abogede v. The State p. 783

PARTNERSHIP - Debts - Accruing from the partnership to one of the partners - Cannot be defeated - Where it is found to be legitimate and just. Yesufu v. Kupper Int. N.V. p. 599

PARTNERSHIP - Payments and liabilities -Incurred by a partner - Whether entitled to be indemnified by the partnership. Yesufu v. Kupper Int. N. V. p. 599

C PARTNERSHIP - Incurring expenses - Where a partnership agreement is in existence - There is no need for either partner to issue a written demand - Before expenses could be incurred by the other partner. Yesufu v. Kupper Int. N.V.p. 599

D PARTNERSHIP - Liability of the partners - For the debts and liability of the partnership - Is jointly and severally. Yesufu v. Kupper Int. N. V. p. 599

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE -Lis pendens doctrine - Transfer of land during the pendency of a suit - Whether the document of transfer is admissible. E Bangboye v. Olusoga p. 655

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Abuse of court process - Appeal - Where there was an appeal against a decision - And the respondent caused the decision to be rectified - Whether pursuing that appeal is an abuse of court process. F Josiah Cornelius Ltd v. Ezenwa p. 703

RES JUDICATA - Subject matter - Averment in affidavit that subject matter is different - Where not denied - Legal implication. State v - Commissioner p. 690

G STATUTES \_ Evidence Act s. 46 - Whether properly applied in favour of respondents - In view of all the findings. Madumere v. Okafor p. 557

SUPREME COURT - Revisiting its past decision - In Jules v. Ajani - Whether necessary in the circumstances of this case. Bangboye v. Olusoga p.655

H TORTS- Trespass to the person-No matter how slight-Gives right of action to recover damages-Plaintiff need not give evidence of damage-To establish his claim to any specific amount of damage. Okonkwo v. Ogbogu p. 810

## **INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (1996) 4 KLR    **xiii****

TORTS-false imprisonment-Instigating arrest and detention of the plaintiff-Whether the defendant was instrumental in setting the law in motion against the plaintiff. Okonkwo v. Ogbogu p. 810

TORTS - Trespass to the person - No matter how slight - Gives right of action to recover damages - Plaintiff need not give evidence of damage - To establish his claim to any specific amount of damage. Okonkwo v. Ogbogu p. 810

TORTS - False imprisonment - Instigating arrest and detention of the plaintiff-Whether malicious and unlawful. Okonkwo v. Ogbogu p. 810 **C**

TORTS - False Imprisonment - Detention of the plaintiff by the police - Whether the defendant was instrumental in setting the law in motion against him" plaintiff. Okonkwo v. Ogbogu p. 810 **D**

## **INDEX OF STATUTES & RULES**

Companies Winding Up Rules r. 19 Josiah Cornelius Ltd v. Ezenwa p. 703 **E**

Companies Allied Matters Act 1990 ss. 312, 310, 311 Josiah Cornelius Ltd v. Ezenwa p. 703

Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria 1979 ss. 220(2)(c), 277 Josiah F Cornelius Ltd v. Ezenwa p. 703; s. 33(1) Onyemeh v. Egbuchulam p. 732; s. 274 (4) (b) Sadikwu v. Dalori p. 796; s. 213(3) Dieli v. Iwuno p. 543; s. 258 (2) Madumere v. Okafor p. 557

Court of Appeal Rules, 1984, 0.6, R. 2; 0.6, R.3(c) 0.6, R.9. Onyemeh v. G Egbuchulam p. 732

Court of Appeal Rules, 1981, 0.3, R.2(2) - (4) Onyemeh v. Egbuchulam p. 732

Court of Appeal Rules 0.3 r. 14 Bangboye v. Olusoga p. 655; O. 3 r. 14(2) H Olugbode v. Sangodeyi p. 618

Criminal Code Cap. 30 Laws of Eastern Nigeria 1963, (applicable in Rivers State) s.319 Gira v. State p. 638

**xiv     INDEX OF STATUTES & RULES IN (1996) 4 KLR**

Criminal Code Cap. 36 of the Laws of Anambra State 1986 s. 274(1) Abogede v. The State p. 783

Criminal Procedure Law Cap. 49 Laws of Bendel State 1976 s. 17 Okonkwo v. B Ogbogu p. 810

Evidence Act ss. 148 (d), 96(1), 24, 65 Okonkwo v. Ogbogu p. 810; s. 53 Josiah Cornelius Ltd v. Ezenwap. 703; ss. 118, 46 Bangboye v. Olusogap. 655

C Evidence Act Cap. 112 LFN 1990 s. 146 Akunyili v. Ejidike p. 747; ss 6 and 27(1) Gira v. State p. 638; ss. 24, 90, 96, 97, 98 and 227(1) Edosomwan v. Ogbeyfun p. 580; ss. 20, 26, 46, 58, 76, 13~, 150 and 199. Madumere v. Okafor p. 557

High Court Law Cap 59 Laws of Northern Nigeria s.17(1) Sadikwu v. Dalori p. D 796

Land Use Act, 1978, s. 5(1) and s.6(1) Dieli v. Iwuno p. 543; ss. 41, 39(1) Sadikwu v. Dalori p. 796

Land Tenure Law Cap 49 Laws of Northern Nigeria 1963 s. 41(2) Sadikwu v. Dalori p. 796

E

Local Government and Community Boundaries Settlement Law Cap 69 Laws of Western Nigeria 1959 s.6(2) State v. Commissioner p. 690

Partnership Law of Bendel State 1976 s. 33(1)(c) Yesufu v. Kupper Int. N.V. F p.599

Supreme Court Rules 0.6 r. 5(4) Bangboye v. Olusoga p. 655; 0.6, r. 5(1); O. 8, r. 2(1) - (5) I Edosomwan v. Ogbeyfun p. 580

G

H